#### Interplay between

hydrodynamic gradient expansion and transient modes in holography, kinetic theory and relativistic fluid mechanics

#### Michal P. Heller

Max Planck Institute for Gravitational Physics (Albert Einstein Institute), Germany National Centre for Nuclear Research, Poland

> many works, but see I6I0.02023 [hep-th] lecture notes I707.02282 [hep-ph] review with Florkowski and Spalinski

# Hydrodynamization

**1103.3452** with Janik & Witaszczyk

1609.04803 with Kurkela & Spalinski

# Hydrodynamization (across conformal theories)

1609.04803 with Kurkela & Spalinski



Viscous hydrodynamics works despite huge anisotropy in the system 0906.4426, 1011.3562 by Chesler & Yaffe; 1103.3452 with Janik & Witaszczyk

#### Relativistic hydrodynamics

hydrodynamics is currents in collective media close to equilibrium (?) **DOFs**: always local energy density  $\epsilon$  and local flow velocity  $u^{\mu}$   $(u_{\nu}u^{\nu} = -1)$ **EOMs:** conservation eqns  $\nabla_{\mu} \langle T^{\mu\nu} \rangle = 0$  for  $\langle T^{\mu\nu} \rangle \underline{\text{expanded in gradients}}$  $\Pi^{\mu\nu}$  $\langle T^{\mu\nu} \rangle = \epsilon \, u^{\mu} u^{\nu} + P(\epsilon) \{ g^{\mu\nu} + u^{\mu} u^{\nu} \} - \eta(\epsilon) \, \sigma^{\mu\nu} - \zeta(\epsilon) \{ g^{\mu\nu} + u^{\mu} u^{\nu} \} (\nabla \cdot u) + \dots$ microscopic croscopic EoS shear viscosity input:  $(P(\epsilon) = \frac{1}{3}\epsilon \text{ for CFTs})$  contribution bulk viscosity (vanishes for CFTs)  $\frac{\Delta \mathcal{P}}{\mathcal{E}/3} \stackrel{\bullet}{=} \frac{2}{\pi} \tilde{w}^{-1}$ 

an EFT of the slow (?) evolution of conserved

This talk: behaviour of the gradient expansion at large orders in the number of  $abla^4$ 

# Hydrodynamic & transient modes

# Theories of (viscous) hydrodynamics

There is a crucial subtlety:  $\nabla_{\mu} \Big( \epsilon u^{\mu} u^{\nu} + P(\epsilon) \{ g^{\mu\nu} + u^{\mu} u^{\nu} \} - \eta(\epsilon) \sigma^{\mu\nu} + ... \Big) = 0$  does not have a well-posed initial value problem  $\longrightarrow$  hydrodynamic theories

Overall idea (MIS): make  $\pi^{\mu\nu}$  obey an independent PDE ensuring its  $\searrow$  to  $-\eta \sigma^{\mu\nu}$ 

$$(\tau_{\pi} u^{\alpha} \mathcal{D}_{\alpha} + 1) [\pi^{\mu\nu} - (-\eta \sigma^{\mu\nu})] = 0 \longrightarrow \pi^{\mu\nu} = -\eta \sigma^{\mu\nu} - \tau_{\pi} u^{\alpha} \mathcal{D}_{\alpha} \pi^{\mu\nu} - \tau_{\pi} u^{\alpha} \mathcal{D}_{\alpha} (\eta \sigma^{\mu\nu})$$
  
decay timescale

Modern incarnation: Baier-Romatschke-Son-Starinets-Stephanov theory 0712.2451

$$\pi^{\mu\nu} = -\eta \sigma^{\mu\nu} - \tau_{\pi} \, u^{\alpha} \mathcal{D}_{\alpha} \pi^{\mu\nu} + \lambda_1 \pi^{\langle \mu}{}_{\alpha} \pi^{\nu \rangle \alpha} + \lambda_2 \pi^{\langle \mu}{}_{\alpha} \Omega^{\nu \rangle \alpha} + \lambda_3 \Omega^{\langle \mu}{}_{\alpha} \Omega^{\nu \rangle \alpha}$$

BRSSS theory will be treated here on equal footing with holography & kinetic theory

### Modes in BRSSS theory

Mode = solution of linearized equations of finite-T theory without any sources

Technical issue: tensor perturbs.  $\longrightarrow$  channels (here everywhere sound channel): Assuming momentum along x<sup>3</sup> direction  $e^{-i\omega x^0 + ikx^3}$ :  $\delta T$ ,  $\delta u^3 \otimes \delta \pi^{33}$ 

conservation

$$\pi^{\mu\nu} = -\eta \sigma^{\mu\nu} - \tau_{\pi} \, u^{\alpha} \mathcal{D}_{\alpha} \pi^{\mu\nu} + \lambda_1 \pi^{\langle \mu}{}_{\alpha} \pi^{\nu\rangle\alpha} + \lambda_2 \pi^{\langle \mu}{}_{\alpha} \Omega^{\nu\rangle\alpha} + \lambda_3 \Omega^{\langle \mu}{}_{\alpha} \Omega^{\nu\rangle\alpha}$$



#### Modes in Einstein-Hilbert holography = QNMs



# HJSW theory and its modes 1409.5087 with Janik, Spalinski & Witaszczyk (see also 1104.2415 by Noronha & Denicol)

MIS/BRSSS idea: 
$$\pi^{\mu
u}$$
 decays exponentially to  $-\eta\,\sigma^{\mu
u}$  . In holography:

HJSW: go from relaxation-type eqn. to damped harmonic oscillator-type eqn. for  $\pi^{\mu\nu}$ :

$$\left\{ \left(\frac{1}{T}\mathcal{D}\right)^2 + 2\Omega_I \frac{1}{T}\mathcal{D} + |\Omega|^2 \right\} \pi^{\mu\nu} = \eta \left|\Omega\right|^2 \sigma^{\mu\nu} - c_\sigma \frac{1}{T}\mathcal{D} \left(\eta \sigma^{\mu\nu}\right) + \dots \quad \text{with} \quad \frac{1}{T} \omega_{QNM}^1 \big|_{k=0} = \pm \Omega_R + i \Omega_I$$
  
hydrodynamics  
(sound wave)  
$$\omega^4 + (\dots) \omega^3 + (\dots) \omega^2 + (\dots) \omega + (\dots) = 0$$
  
transient  
(decay + oscillation)

Tested using holography V (note initialization requires not only  $\pi^{\mu\nu}$  but also  $\partial_0 \pi^{\mu\nu}$ )

#### Modes in linear response theory

$$\delta \langle \hat{T}^{\mu\nu} \rangle(x) = -\frac{1}{2 \times (2\pi)^4} \int d^3k \int d\omega \, e^{-i\,\omega\,x^0 + i\,\mathbf{k}\cdot\mathbf{x}} \, G_R^{\mu\nu,\,\alpha\beta}(\omega,\mathbf{k}) \, \delta g_{\alpha\beta}(\omega,\mathbf{k})$$



In all hydrodynamic theories and Einstein-Hilbert holography modes are single poles of the thermal retarded two-point function of  $T^{\mu\nu}$  in the Fourier space at fixed k

# Hydrodynamics & Transient Modes I: Theories of Hydrodynamics & Holography

I 503.07514 with SpalinskiI 302.0697 with Janik & WitaszczykI 603.05344 with Buchel & Noronha

# Boost-invariant flow [Bjorken 1982]



Boost-invariance: in  $(\tau \equiv \sqrt{x_0^2 - x_1^2}, y \equiv \operatorname{arctanh} \frac{x_1}{x_0}, x_2, x_3)$  coords no y-dep

In a CFT:  $\langle T^{\mu}_{\nu} \rangle = \text{diag} \left\{ -\mathcal{E}(\tau), -\mathcal{E} - \tau \dot{\mathcal{E}}, \mathcal{E} + \frac{1}{2}\tau \dot{\mathcal{E}}, \mathcal{E} + \frac{1}{2}\tau \dot{\mathcal{E}} \right\}$   $\langle T^{2}_{2} \rangle - \langle T^{y}_{y} \rangle$ and via scale-invariance  $\Delta \mathcal{P} = R$  is a function of  $w \equiv \tau T$ Gradient expansion: series in  $\frac{1}{w}$ . **BALLANCE** II03.3452 with Janik & Witaszczyk

# Large order gradient expansion: BRSSS 1503.07514 with Spalinski



Hydrodynamic gradient expansion is a divergent series:  $r_n \sim n!$ 

#### Hydrodynamics & transient modes: BRSSS

 $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{r_n}{w^n}$  does not make sense without a resummation resurgence

Key observations:  $\leq$ 

there must be sth else that cares about ini. cond.
I503.07514 with Spalinski

Linearization of 
$$C_{\tau_{\pi}} w \left(1 + \frac{1}{12}R\right) R' + \left(\frac{1}{3}C_{\tau_{\pi}} + \frac{1}{8}\frac{C_{\lambda_1}}{C_{\eta}}w\right) R^2 + \frac{3}{2}wR - 12C_{\eta} = 0$$
 around  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{r_n}{w^n}$  gives:

integration const. (ini. cond.)  

$$\delta R = \sigma e^{-\frac{3}{2} \frac{1}{C_{\tau_{\pi}}} w} w^{\frac{C_{\eta} - 2C_{\lambda_{1}}}{C_{\tau_{\pi}}}} \left\{ 1 + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \frac{r_{j}^{(1)}}{w^{j}} \right\}^{\checkmark} \text{ (another div. series)}$$
n equilibrium one has  $e^{-\frac{1}{C_{\tau_{\pi}}} T t}$   
t is still true here, but only at a given instance:  $e^{-\frac{1}{C_{\tau_{\pi}}} \int_{\tau_{i}}^{\tau} T(\tau') d\tau'}$   

$$J sing T = \frac{\Lambda}{(\Lambda \tau)^{1/3}} \left( 1 - C_{\eta} \frac{1}{(\Lambda \tau)^{2/3}} + \ldots \right) \text{ one gets } e^{-\frac{3}{2} \frac{1}{C_{\tau_{\pi}}} w} w^{\frac{C_{\eta}}{C_{\tau_{\pi}}}} \ldots$$

To wrap-up, we have just seen the hydro-dressed transient mode of BRSSS at k =0 10/21 see also hep-th/0606149 by Janik & Peschanski



#### Hydrodynamics & transient modes: HJSW 1511.06358 by Aniceto & Spalinski

 $a_1 R'' + a_2 R'^2 + a_3 R' + 12 R^3 + a_4 R^2 + a_5 R + a_6 = 0$  with

$$a_{1} = w^{2} (R + 12)^{2},$$

$$a_{2} = w^{2} (R + 12),$$

$$a_{3} = 12 w (R + 12) (R + 3 w \Omega_{I}),$$

$$a_{4} = 48 (3 w \Omega_{I} - 1),$$

$$a_{5} = 108 (4 C_{\eta} C_{\tau_{\pi}} + 3 w^{2} \Omega^{2}),$$

$$a_{6} = -864 C_{\eta} (2 C_{\tau_{\pi}} + 3 w \Omega^{2}).$$



12/21

#### Hydrodynamics & transient modes: holography



Infinitely many transient QNMs  $\rightarrow$  infinitely many parameters in the transseries [3/2]

#### Lesson from cosmology 1603.05344 with Buchel & Noronha

$$\frac{d\operatorname{Entropy}}{dt} = V \times \left(\sum_{n=0}^{\infty} c_n \xi^n\right)^2 + \dots \text{ with } \xi = \frac{H}{T} \text{ for a hQFT in } -dt^2 + e^{2Ht} d\vec{x}^2$$
$$T \sim e^{-Ht} \longrightarrow e^{-i\Omega_{\pm} \int_{t_i}^t T(t')dt'} \sim e^{-i\Omega_{\pm} \cdot \left(-\frac{T(t)}{H}\right)}$$



Hydrodynamic gradient expansion knowns about all transient QNMs

# Emerging picture

Hydrodynamic gradient expansion is a divergent series — hydrodynamization

Transient singularities of  $G_R^{T_{\mu\nu}}(\omega,k)$  vs. singularities of Borel transform of hydro



Appealing analogy with quantum mechanics:

# non-equilibrium physicsQM with $V = -\frac{1}{2}x^2 (1 - \sqrt{g}x)^2$ gradient expansion in $\frac{1}{w}$ perturbative series in gtransient QNMs $e^{-i\frac{3}{2}\Omega_{\pm}w}(\ldots)$ instanton $e^{-1/(3g)}(\ldots)$

**1302.0697** with Janik & Witaszczyk

# Resummed hydrodynamics (Far from equilibrium hydrodynamics)

1503.07514 with Spalinski

# (BRSSS) resummed hydrodynamics [503.075] 4 with Spalinski

**Idea:** resummed /all order / far from equilibrium hydrodynamics = attractor solutions



One can also approx. resum transseries:  $R(w) \approx \sum_{j=0}^{2} \sigma^{j} e^{-jAw} w^{j\beta} \Phi_{(j)}(w)$ Requires 3 Borel summations
[6/2]

BRSSS:

$$C_{\tau_{\pi}} w \left(1 + \frac{1}{12}R\right) R' + \left(\frac{1}{3}C_{\tau_{\pi}} + \frac{1}{8}\frac{C_{\lambda_{1}}}{C_{\eta}}w\right) R^{2} + \frac{3}{2} w R - 12 C_{\eta} = 0.$$

 $\approx$  attractor solution (,,slow roll' approximation)

Recently Romatschke in 1704.08699 found such attractors in RTA kinetic theory



# Hydrodynamics & Transient Modes II: RTA Kinetic Theory

I609.04803 with Kurkela & SpalinskiI707.02282 with Florkowski & Spalinski work in progress with Svensson

#### **RTA** kinetic theory

Natural language to talk about weakly coupled media is the Boltzmann equation:

$$p^{\mu}\partial_{\mu}f(x,p) = C[f(x,p)]$$
 with  $\langle T^{\mu\nu}\rangle(x) = \int_{\text{momenta}} f(x,p) p^{\mu}p^{\nu}$ 

LO C[(x,p)] for gauge theories is complicated. We will use instead

$$C[f(x,p)] = -\frac{p^{\mu}u_{\mu}}{\tau_{rel}} \left\{ f(x,p) - f_0(x,p) \right\} \text{ with } f_0(x,p) = e^{\frac{u_{\mu}p^{\mu}}{T}}$$

This equation is, typically, highly nonlinear due to  $\langle T^{\mu\nu} \rangle u_{\nu} = -\mathcal{E}(T) u^{\mu\nu}$ 

CFTs: 
$$p^{\mu}p_{\mu} = 0$$
 and  $\tau_{rel} = \frac{\gamma}{T}$ .

# Modes in RTA kinetic theory 1512.02641 by Romatschke

Sound channel at  $k \tau_{rel} = 0.1$ , 1.0 & 4.531

1707.02282 with Florkowski & Spalinski



Very different from holography: one hydro mode and one branch-cut at  $k \neq 0$   $\downarrow k \rightarrow 0$ single pole at  $\omega = -i \frac{1}{\tau_{rel}}$ 

QNM in kinetic theory

1609.04803 with Kurkela & Spalinski



# Seeing leading transient in dynamics $e^{-\frac{1}{\gamma}\int_{\tau_0}^{\tau} T(\tau'')d\tau''} \int_{\mathbb{R}^{1/2}}^{f_{\text{ini}}} H(s) = \frac{s^2}{2} + \frac{\arctan\sqrt{\frac{1}{s^2}-1}}{2\sqrt{\frac{1}{s^2}-1}} \\ H(\tau) = D(\tau, \tau_0)\frac{\pi^2 \mathcal{E}^0(\tau)}{6} + \int_{\tau_0}^{\tau} d\tau' \left(\frac{T(\tau')}{\gamma}D(\tau, \tau')\right) \times \left(T^4(\tau')H\left(\frac{\tau'}{\tau}\right)\right)$

Baym 1984; 1305.7234 by Florkowski, Ryblewski & Strickland

We assume the same as in BRSSS:  $\delta R \sim e^{-Aw} w^{\beta} \left( 1 + O\left(\frac{1}{w}\right) \right) + \dots$ 

Instead of  $\delta R$  we take  $\Delta R$  and consider:



# Executive summary

I 103.3452 with Janik & Witaszczyk
I 302.0697 with Janik & Witaszczyk
I 603.05344 with Buchel & Noronha
I 503.07514 with Spalinski
I 609.04803 with Kurkela & Spalinski

[707.02282 [hep-ph] review with Florkowski and Spalinski



21/21