Neoclassical calculation of the tangential electric field in stellarators close to omnigeneity (and tokamaks with broken symmetry)

Iván Calvo¹, José Luis Velasco¹, Félix I. Parra^{2,3}, J. Arturo Alonso¹ and J. M. García-Regaña¹

¹Laboratorio Nacional de Fusión, CIEMAT ²Rudolf Peierls Centre for Theoretical Physics, University of Oxford ³Culham Centre for Fusion Energy

> 10th Plasma Kinetics Working Group Meeting Wolfgang Pauli Institute, Vienna July 17, 2017

Laboratorio Nacional de Fusión





Why the interest in the tangential electric field?

- The tangential electric field produces a radial E × B drift that affects the radial flux of moderate- to high-Z impurities [García-Regaña, PPCF (2013)].
- It has been ignored for a long time in stellarator neoclassical calculations (sometimes this is justified, but not always). Recently, some codes have started to calculate it. Comparisons between EUTERPE and SFINCS in [García-Regaña, NF (2017)].
- The tangential magnetic drift has traditionally been ignored as well (again, sometimes this is justified, sometimes not). Global simulations with FORTEC-3D that include it, recently reported [Matsuoka, PoP (2015)], [Huang, PoP (2017)].
- In situations in which the tangential magnetic drift counts, the behavior of the tangential electric field is particularly interesting.



Coordinates on phase space

- Spatial coordinates $\{\psi, \alpha, I\}$, where
 - ▶ $\psi \in [0, \psi_{\max}]$ determines the magnetic surface and has dimensions of length,
 - $\alpha \in [0, 2\pi)$ is an angle that labels magnetic field lines on the surface,
 - $I \in [0, I_{\max}(\psi, \alpha))$ is the arc length along the field line.

Then, the magnetic field can be expressed as¹

$$\mathbf{B} = \Psi'_t(\psi) \nabla \psi \times \nabla \alpha.$$

- Velocity coordinates $\{\mathcal{E}, \mu, \sigma\}$, where
 - E = v²/2 + Zeφ/m is the total energy per mass unit, φ(ψ(x), α(x), l(x)) is the electrostatic potential, Ze is the charge of the species, e is the proton charge and m is the mass.
 - μ is the magnetic moment,

•
$$\sigma = v_{||}/|v_{||}|$$
, with $v_{||} = \sigma \sqrt{2(\mathcal{E} - \mu B - Ze\varphi/m)}$.

¹Primes denote derivatives with respect to ψ .

Drift-kinetic and quasineutrality equations

• The equation for the ion² distribution function $F(\psi(\mathbf{x}), \alpha(\mathbf{x}), l(\mathbf{x}), \mathcal{E}, \mu, \sigma)$ is $\dot{\mathbf{x}} \cdot \nabla F = C_{ii}[F, F],$

with

$$\begin{split} \dot{\mathbf{x}} \cdot \nabla I &= \mathbf{v}_{||} \sim O(\mathbf{v}_t), \\ \dot{\mathbf{x}} \cdot \nabla \psi &= \mathbf{v}_d \cdot \nabla \psi \sim O(\rho_* \mathbf{v}_t), \\ \dot{\mathbf{x}} \cdot \nabla \alpha &= \mathbf{v}_d \cdot \nabla \alpha \sim O(\rho_* \mathbf{v}_t R_0^{-1}). \end{split}$$

Here, $\mathbf{v}_d := \mathbf{v}_M + \mathbf{v}_E$ is the sum of the magnetic and $E \times B$ drifts, v_t is the thermal speed, $R_0 \sim |\nabla \ln B|^{-1}$ is a characteristic macroscopic length and $\rho_* = \rho/R_0$ is the normalized Larmor radius.

• Denoting by N_e the electron density, the quasineutrality equation reads

$$Z\int F\mathrm{d}^3v=N_e.$$

In a mass ratio expansion $\sqrt{m_e/m} \ll 1$, C_{ie} is negligible and only the adiabatic response of the electrons counts in the quasineutrality equation.

²We omit the subscript "*i*" for almost every ion quantity.

Iván Calvo, CIEMAT, Madrid

Drift-kinetic equation at low collisionality³: lowest-order

- Take a maximal ordering $\nu_* \sim \rho_* \ll 1$, where $\nu_* = \nu_{ii} R_0 / v_t$.
 - This includes the limits $\nu_* \ll \rho_* \ll 1$ and $\rho_* \ll \nu_* \ll 1$.

Expand the distribution function in \(\rho_*\) as

$$F=F_0+F_1+\ldots,$$

where $F_1 \sim \rho_* F_0$ is negligible in this talk.

 \blacksquare To lowest order in $\rho_*,$ the drift-kinetic equation gives

$$v_{||}\partial_l F_0=0.$$

• F_0 is determined by averages over l of the drift-kinetic equation to next order in ρ_* .

³We do not include aspect ratio factors in the theoretical discussion. If the inverse aspect ratio ϵ is small, low collisionality means $\nu_* \ll \epsilon^{3/2}$.

Drift-kinetic equation at low collisionality: next order

Passing particles

$$\int_{0}^{2\pi} \mathrm{d}\alpha \int_{0}^{I_{\max}(\psi,\alpha)} \frac{1}{|v_{||}|} C_{ii}[F_{0},F_{0}] \mathrm{d}I = 0.$$

Trapped particles

$$-\partial_{\psi}J\partial_{\alpha}F_{0}+\partial_{\alpha}J\partial_{\psi}F_{0}=\sum_{\sigma}\frac{Ze\Psi_{t}'}{m}\int_{I_{b_{1}}}^{I_{b_{2}}}\frac{1}{|v_{||}|}C_{ii}[F_{0},F_{0}]dI,$$

conveniently expressed in terms of the second adiabatic invariant,

$$J(\psi, \alpha, \mathcal{E}, \mu) := 2 \int_{I_{b_1}}^{I_{b_2}} |\mathbf{v}_{||}| \mathsf{d}I.$$



Second adiabatic invariant and perpendicular drifts

$$2\int_{l_{b_1}}^{l_{b_2}} \frac{1}{|\mathbf{v}_{||}|} \mathbf{v}_d \cdot \nabla \psi \, \mathrm{d}I = \frac{m}{Ze\Psi_t'} \partial_\alpha J; \qquad 2\int_{l_{b_1}}^{l_{b_2}} \frac{1}{|\mathbf{v}_{||}|} \mathbf{v}_d \cdot \nabla \alpha \, \mathrm{d}I = -\frac{m}{Ze\Psi_t'} \partial_\psi J$$

• Without further assumptions, $\partial_{\alpha} J |\nabla \alpha| \sim \partial_{\psi} J |\nabla \psi|$, and the drift-kinetic equation for trapped particles,

$$-\partial_{\psi}J\partial_{\alpha}F_{0}+\frac{\partial_{\alpha}J\partial_{\psi}F_{0}}{\sigma}=\sum_{\sigma}\frac{Ze\Psi_{t}'}{m}\int_{I_{b_{1}}}^{I_{b_{2}}}\frac{1}{|v_{||}|}C_{ii}[F_{0},F_{0}]dI,$$

is radially non-local.

If the aspect ratio and the radial electric field are sufficiently large, the tangential component of v_E dominates and the equation becomes radially non-local. But this is not the most general situation.

Omnigeneous stellarators⁴: $\partial_{\alpha}J = 0$



• In these figures we plot $B(\Theta, \zeta)$, where Θ and ζ are Boozer angles. Expansions around omnigeneity [Calvo, PPCF (2017)]

- **B** = $\mathbf{B}_0 + \delta \mathbf{B}_1$, $0 \le \delta \ll 1$, where \mathbf{B}_0 is omnigeneous.
- If |∇B₁|/|∇B₀| ≪ δ⁻¹, no new wells are created and a linear expansion holds,
 J(ψ, α) = J⁽⁰⁾(ψ) + δJ⁽¹⁾(ψ, α) +

• We always assume that B is stellarator-symmetric, $B(-\Theta, -\zeta) = B(\Theta, \zeta)$.

⁴[Cary, PoP (1997)], [Landreman, PoP (2012)], [Parra, NF (2015)]

Iván Calvo, CIEMAT, Madrid

Tangential electric field in stellarators close to omnigeneity

Radially local, linear equations when $\delta \ll 1$

•
$$\varphi(\psi, \alpha, I) = \varphi_0(\psi) + \delta \varphi^{(1)}(\psi, \alpha, I) + \dots$$

- Change velocity coordinates to $v = \sqrt{2(\mathcal{E} Ze\varphi_0(\psi)/m)}$ and $\lambda = \mu [\mathcal{E} Ze\varphi_0(\psi)/m]^{-1}$.
- $\bullet F_0 = F_M + \delta g^{(1)} + \dots$
 - F_M is a Maxwellian distribution constant on flux surfaces,

$$F_{M}(\psi, \mathbf{v}) = n(\psi) \left(\frac{m}{2\pi T(\psi)}\right)^{3/2} \exp\left(-\frac{m\mathbf{v}^{2}}{2T(\psi)}\right).$$

► $g^{(1)}$ vanishes for passing trajectories, does not depend on l and can be chosen such that $\int_0^{2\pi} g^{(1)} d\alpha = 0$.

- Keeping terms linear in δ, the system of equations consisting of the drift-kinetic equation and the quasineutrality equation
 - is linear in $g^{(1)}$ and $\varphi^{(1)}$,
 - ▶ is radially local,
 - ► rigorously includes the tangential magnetic drift.

Radially local, linear equations when $\delta \ll 1$ Drift-kinetic equation

$$-\partial_{\psi}J^{(0)}\partial_{\alpha}g^{(1)} + \partial_{\alpha}J^{(1)}\Upsilon F_{M} = \sum_{\sigma}\frac{Ze\Psi_{t}'}{m}\int_{I_{b_{10}}}^{I_{b_{20}}}\frac{dI}{|v_{||}^{(0)}|}C_{ii}^{\ell(0)}[g^{(1)}],$$

Quasineutrality equation

$$\left(\frac{Z}{T}+\frac{1}{T_e}\right)\varphi^{(1)}=\frac{2\pi}{en}\int_0^\infty dv \int_{B_{0,\max}^{-1}}^{B^{-1}} d\lambda \frac{v^3 B_0}{|v_{||}^{(0)}|}g^{(1)},$$

with

$$\begin{split} \partial_{\psi} J^{(0)} &= -\int_{l_{b_{10}}}^{l_{b_{20}}} \frac{\lambda v \partial_{\psi} B_0 + 2Ze/(mv)\varphi'_0}{\sqrt{1 - \lambda B_0}} dI, \\ J^{(1)} &= -\int_{l_{b_{10}}}^{l_{b_{20}}} \frac{\lambda v B_1 + 2Ze/(mv)\varphi^{(1)}}{\sqrt{1 - \lambda B_0}} dI, \\ \Upsilon &= \frac{n'}{n} + \frac{T'}{T} \left(\frac{mv^2}{2T} - \frac{3}{2}\right) + \frac{Ze\varphi'_0}{T}. \end{split}$$

• Superindices (0) mean that B is replaced by B_0 in the corresponding quantity.

Iván Calvo, CIEMAT, Madrid

KNOSOS (KiNetic Orbit-Averaging SOlver for Stellarators) code⁵

- It solves these equations with maximal ordering $\nu_* \sim \rho_*$.
 - For the moment, $C_{ii}^{\ell(0)}$ is a pitch-angle scattering operator.
- In what follows, we discuss analytically the scalings and spatial structure of $\varphi^{(1)}$ in the $1/\nu$, $\sqrt{\nu}$ and superbanana-plateau collisionality regimes.
- We complement the discussion with calculations by KNOSOS in an 'academic' stellarator close to omnigeneity.



- For B_0 , we use the field given in [Landreman, PoP (2012)]. Take average magnitude $B_{00} = 3.2$ T, $\iota = 1.05$, inverse aspect ratio $\epsilon = \psi/R_0 = 0.067$, $R_0 = 6$ m and number of periods N = 4.
- $\bullet B_1 \propto \cos(2\Theta).$

• H plasma,
$$\rho_* = 5.6 \cdot 10^{-4}$$
,
 $T_i = 10$ keV.

⁵First calculations with KNOSOS presented in [Velasco, EPS Conference (2017)].

1/
u regime: $ho_* \ll
u_* \ll 1$

$$\partial_{\psi} J^{(0)} \partial_{\alpha} g^{(1)} \ll \sum_{\sigma} \frac{Ze\Psi'_{t}}{m} \int_{l_{b_{10}}}^{l_{b_{20}}} \frac{dI}{|v_{||}^{(0)}|} C_{ii}^{\ell(0)}[g^{(1)}]$$
$$g^{(1)} \sim \frac{\rho_{*}}{\nu_{*}} F_{M}$$
$$\frac{Ze\varphi^{(1)}}{T} \sim \frac{\rho_{*}}{\nu_{*}}$$
$$J^{(1)} \approx J_{B}^{(1)} = -\int_{l_{b_{10}}}^{l_{b_{20}}} \frac{\lambda v B_{1}}{\sqrt{1 - \lambda B_{0}}} dI$$

The drift-kinetic equation does not contain $\varphi^{(1)}$,

$$\sum_{\sigma} \frac{Z e \Psi'_t}{m} \int_{I_{b_{10}}}^{I_{b_{20}}} |v_{||}^{(0)}|^{-1} C_{ii}^{\ell(0)}[g^{(1)}] dI = \partial_{\alpha} J_B^{(1)} \Upsilon F_M.$$

From the quasineutrality equation,

$$arphi^{(1)} = \left(rac{Z}{T} + rac{1}{T_e}
ight)^{-1} rac{2\pi B_0}{en} \int_0^\infty {
m d}
u v^3 \int_{B_{0,{
m max}}^{-1}}^{B^{-1}} {
m d} \lambda |v_{||}^{(0)}|^{-1} g^{(1)}.$$

• $\varphi^{(1)}$ is stellarator antisymmetric.

Iván Calvo, CIEMAT, Madrid

1/
u regime: $ho_* \ll
u_* \ll 1$



 \blacksquare In this figure, $\nu_{*}\approx 10^{-2}$ and $\varphi_{0}^{\prime}=-10~{\rm kV/m}.$

$u_* \ll ho_* \ll 1$: It depends on the zeroes of $\partial_\psi J^{(0)}$

- The zeroes of ∂_ψ J⁽⁰⁾ correspond to points of phase space where the average tangential E × B and magnetic drifts cancel each other.
- The condition $\partial_{\psi} J^{(0)} = 0$ can be conveniently expressed as

$$\lambda \overline{\partial_{\psi} B_0}(\psi, \lambda) = -rac{2Ze arphi_0'(\psi)}{m v^2},$$

where

$$\overline{(\cdot)} = \frac{1}{\tau_b^{(0)}} \sum_{\sigma} \int_{l_{b_{10}}}^{l_{b_{20}}} (\cdot) |v_{||}^{(0)}|^{-1} \mathrm{d}I, \qquad \tau_b^{(0)}(\psi, v, \lambda) = 2 \int_{l_{b_{10}}}^{l_{b_{20}}} |v_{||}^{(0)}|^{-1} \mathrm{d}I.$$

A necessary condition for this equation to have solutions for $v \lesssim v_t$ is

$$rac{Zearphi_0'}{T}\lesssim rac{1}{R_0}$$

Regarding transport:

- $\nu_* \ll \rho_*$ and $\partial_{\psi} J^{(0)} \neq 0$ (at least for $v \lesssim v_t$): $\sqrt{\nu}$ regime.
- ▶ $\nu_* \ll \rho_*$ and $\partial_{\psi} J^{(0)} = 0$ at some point in phase space (with $v \leq v_t$): superbanana-plateau regime.

 $u_* \ll
ho_* \ll 1 \text{ and } \partial_\psi J^{(0)}$ never vanishes

$$\sum_{\sigma} \frac{Z e \Psi'_t}{m} \int_{I_{b_{10}}}^{I_{b_{20}}} |v_{||}^{(0)}|^{-1} C_{ii}^{\ell(0)}[g^{(1)}] dI \ll \partial_{\psi} J^{(0)} \partial_{\alpha} g^{(1)}$$

Solution of the drift-kinetic equation to lowest order in $u_*/
ho_*$, $g^{(1)}=g_0+\ldots$,

$$g_0 = \frac{1}{\partial_{\psi} J^{(0)}} \left(J^{(1)} - \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} J^{(1)} d\alpha \right) \Upsilon_i F_{i0}.$$

 $arphi^{(1)}$ is found from the quasineutrality equation, that takes the form

$$\left(\frac{Z}{T}+\frac{1}{T_e}\right)\varphi^{(1)}=\frac{2\pi B_0}{en}\int_0^\infty \mathsf{d} v\,v^3\int_{B_{0,\max}^{-1}}^{B^{-1}}\mathsf{d}\lambda|v_{||}^{(0)}|^{-1}g_0.$$

- $Ze\varphi^{(1)}/T \sim (\nu_*)^0 (\rho_*)^0$.
- $\varphi^{(1)}$ is stellarator symmetric.
- This is the way to calculate $\varphi^{(1)}$ in a plasma in the $\sqrt{\nu}$ regime. g_0 does not give radial transport (this is produced by a layer of size $\Delta_{\lambda}^{\sqrt{\nu}} \sim (\nu_*/\rho_*)^{1/2} \ll 1$ in the coordinate λ), but however determines $\varphi^{(1)}$.

 $u_* \ll
ho_* \ll 1$ and $\partial_\psi J^{(0)}$ never vanishes



 $u_* \ll
ho_* \ll 1$ and $\partial_\psi J^{(0)} = 0$ for some value of λ

- Assume that $\partial_{\psi} J^{(0)}(\psi, v, \lambda_r) = 0$ has one solution, $\lambda_r(\psi, v)$.
- Expand the drift-kinetic equation around the position of the resonance,

$$\partial_{\lambda}\partial_{\psi}J_{r}^{(0)}(\lambda-\lambda_{r})\partial_{\alpha}g_{\mathrm{rl}}+
u_{\lambda}k\partial_{\lambda}^{2}g_{\mathrm{rl}}=\left(\partial_{\alpha}J_{B,r}^{(1)}+\partial_{\alpha}\widehat{J_{\varphi}^{(1)}}
ight)\Upsilon F_{M},$$

where $k(\psi, v) = O(B_0^{-2}R_0\rho_*^{-1})$, subindices r indicate that the corresponding quantity is evaluated at $\lambda = \lambda_r(\psi, v)$ and $\widehat{J_{\varphi}^{(1)}}$ is an approximation around λ_r of

$$J_{\varphi}^{(1)} = -rac{2Ze}{mv} \int_{l_{b_{10}}}^{l_{b_{20}}} rac{arphi^{(1)}}{\sqrt{1-\lambda B_0}} \mathsf{d} I.$$

- $g_{\rm rl}$ is localized in a layer $B_0 \Delta_{\lambda}^{\rm sb-p} \sim (\nu_*/\rho_*)^{1/3} \ll 1$ and $g_{\rm rl} \sim (B_0 \Delta_{\lambda}^{\rm sb-p})^{-1} F_M$.
- This layer is responsible for superbanana-plateau transport.
- g_{rl} does not have definite parity with respect to stellarator symmetry transformations.

Quasineutrality equation when $\nu_* \ll \rho_* \ll 1$ and $\partial_{\psi} J^{(0)} = 0$ for some value of λ

In principle, the two pieces

$$g_0^{\text{out}} = g_0 - \frac{\Upsilon F_M}{(\lambda - \lambda_r) \partial_\lambda \partial_\psi J_r^{(0)}} \left(J_{B,r}^{(1)} - \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} J_{B,r}^{(1)} d\alpha + \widehat{J_{\varphi}^{(1)}} - \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \widehat{J_{\varphi}^{(1)}} d\alpha \right)$$

and $g_{\rm rl}$ contribute to the quasineutrality equation on an equal footing.

$$\left(\frac{Z}{T} + \frac{1}{T_e}\right)\varphi^{(1)} = \frac{2\pi B_0}{en} \left[\int_0^\infty dv \int_{B_{0,\max}^{-1}}^{B^{-1}} d\lambda \frac{v^3 g_0^{\rm out}}{|v_{||}^{(0)}|} + \int_{v_{\min}}^\infty dv \int_{\Delta_{\lambda}^{\rm sb-p}} d\lambda \frac{v^3 g_{\rm rl}}{|v_{||}^{(0)}|}\right]$$

Two subcases:

$$2Z_i e[mv^2 \lambda_r \partial_\lambda \overline{\partial_\psi B_0}(\psi, \lambda_r)]^{-1} \varphi_0' \gg \Delta_\lambda^{\rm sb-p}$$

• $2Z_i e[mv^2 \lambda_r \partial_\lambda \overline{\partial_\psi B_0}(\psi, \lambda_r)]^{-1} \varphi_0' \ll \Delta_\lambda^{\mathrm{sb-p}}$

More interesting. And new.

Quasineutrality equation when $\nu_* \ll \rho_* \ll 1$ and $\partial_{\psi} J^{(0)} = 0$ for some value of λ

$$\begin{split} & \left(\frac{Z}{T} + \frac{1}{T_e}\right)\varphi^{(1)} = \frac{2\pi}{en} \int_0^\infty dv \int_{B_{0,\max}^{-1}}^{B^{-1}} d\lambda \frac{v^3 B_0}{|v_{||}^{(0)}|} g_0^{\text{out}} \\ & + \frac{2\pi B_0}{en} \int_{v_{\min}}^\infty dv \, v^2 \int_{-\infty}^{\lambda_L(l)} d\lambda \frac{g_{\text{rl}}}{\sqrt{\lambda_r |\partial_l B_0(l_L)|(l-l_L) - (\lambda - \lambda_r) B_0(l_L)|}} \\ & + \frac{2\pi B_0}{en} \int_{v_{\min}}^\infty dv \, v^2 \int_{-\infty}^{\lambda_R(l)} d\lambda \frac{g_{\text{rl}}}{\sqrt{\lambda_r |\partial_l B_0(l_R)|(l_R - l) - (\lambda - \lambda_r) B_0(l_R)|}} \\ & + \frac{2\pi B_0}{en} \int_{v_{\min}}^\infty dv \, v^2 \left[\frac{1}{\sqrt{1 - \lambda_r B_0(l)}} - \frac{1}{\sqrt{\lambda_r |\partial_l B_0(l_L)|(l-l_L)}} \right] \\ & - \frac{1}{\sqrt{\lambda_r |\partial_l B_0(l_R)|(l_R - l)}} \\ \end{split}$$

Let *I_L* and *I_R* denote the bounce points of the trajectory λ = λ_r. The red term diverges at *I* = *I_L* and *I* = *I_R*.

Scalings of $\varphi^{(1)}$ when $\nu_* \ll \rho_* \ll 1$ and $\partial_{\psi} J^{(0)} = 0$ for some value of λ

- If $2Z_i e[m_i v^2 \lambda_r \partial_\lambda \overline{\partial_\psi B_0}(\lambda_r)]^{-1} \varphi'_0 \gg \Delta_\lambda^{\rm sb-p}$, the dependence of λ_r on v is strong enough for the integral over v to smooth out the divergence of $1/\sqrt{1 - \lambda_r B_0(l)}$ at $l = l_L$ and $l = l_R$. Then,
 - $Ze\varphi^{(1)}/T \sim (\nu_*)^0 (\rho_*)^0$.
- If 2Z_ie[m_iv²λ_r∂_λ∂_ψB₀(λ_r)]⁻¹φ'₀ ≪ Δ^{sb-p}_λ, λ_r is approximately independent of v and no such smoothing happens. Then,

• $Ze\varphi^{(1)}/T \sim (\nu_*/\rho_*)^{-1/6}$,

when $|I - I_j| \sim B_0 \Delta_{\lambda}^{\mathrm{sb-p}} R_0$, j = L, R.













$$u_* \ll
ho_* \ll 1$$
, $\partial_\psi J^{(0)} = 0$ for some value of λ and $arphi_0' = 0$



$$u_* \ll
ho_* \ll 1$$
, $\partial_\psi J^{(0)} = 0$ for some value of λ and $arphi_0' = 0$

















- Extend the theory and the code to treat more general deviations from omnigeneity.
- Evaluate the impact of φ⁽¹⁾ on the radial transport of main ions and impurities in regimes where the tangential magnetic drift is important.
- Analyze how all this depends on the aspect ratio of the stellarator.